

**Hampton Roads Transportation
Accountability Commission (HRTAC)
Summary Minutes of the November 19, 2015 Regular Meeting**

The Hampton Roads Transportation Accountability Commission (HRTAC) Regular Meeting was called to order at 12:47 p.m. in the HRTPO Regional Board Room, 723 Woodlake Drive, Chesapeake, Virginia, with the following in attendance:

HRTAC Voting Members in Attendance:

William Sessoms, Jr., Chair	Dallas Jones
Clyde Haulman, Vice-Chair	Alan Krasnoff *
Rex Alphin	McKinley Price
Paul Fraim	Tom Shepperd, Jr.
Michael Hipple	George Wallace
Delegate Johnny Joannou	Kenneth Wright
Linda Johnson	Delegate David Yancey
Delegate Chris Jones *	

HRTAC Executive Director:

Kevin Page

Other Participants:

Cathie France	David Miller
Tom Inglima	James Utterback
Dep. Sec. Grindley Johnson	

HRTAC Voting Members Absent:

Senator Kenneth Alexander	Raystine Johnson-Ashburn
W. Eugene Hunt, Jr.	Senator Frank Wagner

HRTAC Nonvoting Members Absent:

Charlie Kilpatrick	Jennifer Mitchell
John Malbon	John Reinhart

* Denotes Late Arrival or Early Departure

Others Recorded Attending:

Will Christopher, Ellis W. James (Citizens); Kelly Lackey, Earl Sorey (CH); Randy Martin (FR); Mary Bunting, Brian DeProfio (HA); Rob Brown, Thelma Drake, Bryan Pennington, Jeffrey Raliski, Ron Williams (NO); Bryan Stilley, Jerri Wilson (NN); Bob Baldwin, John Gergely, Sherri Neil, Lydia Pettis Patton (PO); Marcus Jones, Eric Nielsen, Patrick Roberts (SU); Marvin Collins (WM); Neil Morgan, Randy Wheeler (YK); Georgine Blumling (AAA Tidewater Virginia); Bill Cashman, Chris Fronheiser (AECOM); Rich Clifton (Allan Myers); Clyde Clark, Cheryle Mack (BB&T); Bath Arnold (CH2M); John Herzke (Clarke Nexsen); Frank Papcin (CTAC); J. Elias O'Neal (Daily Press); Scott Forehand, Don Quisenberry (eScribeSolutions); Mark Osenbaugh (E.V. Williams, Inc.); Judith E. Brown (HR Public Transportation Alliance); Neal Crawford (HRTAC Funding Strategies Advisory Committee); George Consolvo, Kevin White (Kaufman & Canoles); Tracy Naynard (McGuire Woods Consulting); Karen McPherson (McPherson Consulting); Chuck Eastman (Michael Baker International); Michelle Martin (Parsons Brinckerhoff); James Webb Jones (Poole Mahoney); Mark Geduldig-Yatrofsky (Portsmouthcitywatch.org); Ken Yarberry (RK&K Engineers); Mindy Hughes (Seventh Point Transportation PR); Robert K. Dean (Tidewater Libertarian Party); Dianna Howard (TLP, VBTA, VBTP); Tony Gibson, Jim Long, Dawn Odom (VDOT); Jordan Pescale (Virginia Pilot); Larry Cumey, Matt Gregory (WAVY-TV, Media General); Amber Randolph, Brett Spain (Wilcox & Savage); Phil Lohr (WRA); Kristina Zverjako (WVEC-TV, Tegna); Nancy Collins, Robert Crum, Andrea Gayer, Randy Keaton, Mike Long, Joe Turner, Chris Vaigneur (HRPDC); Rob Case, Danetta Jankosky, Mike Kimbrel, Camelia Ravanbakht, Dale Stith (HRTPO)

Call to Order

Chair William Sessions called the meeting to order at 12:47 p.m.

Approval of Agenda

Mr. Michael Hippel Moved to approve the agenda; seconded by Ms. Linda Johnson. The motion carried.

Public Comment Period (limit to 5 minutes per individual)

Mr. Frank Papcin spoke regarding transportation plans and noted the proposals show an intent to manipulate the manner in which citizens use the roads. He shared concern over plans for tolls and noted alternatives not considered: employers staggering work hours, requested legislation for an additional tax for regional roads, or a survey asking whether citizens preferred a tax or tolls. He offered that tolls punish people and that HOT lanes give special favors to some. He requested the Commission to think of an alternative way to pay for roads other than tolls.

Mr. Mark Geduldig-Yatrofsky expressed concern regarding representation when the representative of a given community is not in attendance. In addition, he recommended reconstituting HRTAC so that the members are directly elected by the citizens of the region with no members of the General Assembly included and structured like a borough system.

Ms. Dianna Howard, vice chair of the Virginia Beach Tea Party, shared information gleaned from her attendance at a number of meetings. She stated that she heard the Secretary of Transportation opine that there is not enough state money to fund all projects submitted through HB2 and that other money sources, like tolls, will be needed to fund the projects. She said that she asked him why projects like light rail did not have to go through the HB2 process, to which he replied that they do, but that it was not submitted. She stated that she realizes that HRTF is for roads, bridges, and tunnels. She asked the Commission to consider the economic impact tolls will have on the region and select a scenario that will have the least negative results.

Mr. Robert Dean remarked about the recent tax increases and their impact on a family's financial stability. He noted that some of the transportation projects being considered would not relieve traffic congestion, but are planned to get the new port facility constructed. He recommended building a bridge from Willoughby to the Peninsula, one that would have six lanes divided and reversible. He added that the project would be faster and cheaper to build, citing the Chesapeake Bay Bridge Tunnel, which took 42 months and cost \$450 million.

Consent Items

Chair Sessoms requested a motion to approve all consent items. Mr. Clyde Haulman Moved to approve the suggested motions regarding the October 15, 2015 HRTAC Regular Meeting Minutes, the Memorandum of Agreement – Interstate 64 Peninsula Widening Segment I Funding, and Ratification of Amended and Restated Bylaws; seconded by Mr. Paul Fraim. The Motion carried.

Action Items

A. HRTF Legislative Agenda

Mr. Tom Inglima explained the proposed amendments in the Legislative Agenda provided to the Members. Members proceeded to discuss the language. Mayor Krasnoff expressed concern that item "E, System-Wide Financing Approach", could apply to non-HRTAC projects. Mr. Inglima explained the intent of the proposed amendment and offered that the language could be revised to clarify it only applies to Commission projects.

Mr. Kenneth Wright asked that voting on the Legislative Agenda be done separately for each agenda item.

Mr. Inglima proceeded to read each Legislative Agenda item so it could be voted on separately.

A. Transfer of HRTF Monies to HRTAC

Mr. Tom Shepperd Moved to approve the Hampton Roads Transportation Accountability Commission 2015-2016 Legislative Agenda Item "A"; seconded by Mr. Clyde Haulman. The Motion carried.

B. Expanded use of HRTF Monies for Administrative Expenses

Mr. Chris Jones Moved to approve the Hampton Roads Transportation Accountability Commission 2015-2016 Legislative Agenda Item "B"; seconded by Mr. Clyde Haulman. The Motion carried.

C. Commission Member Designees

Mr. Tom Shepperd Moved to approve the Hampton Roads Transportation Accountability Commission 2015-2016 Legislative Agenda Item "C"; seconded by Mr. Johnny Joannou. The Motion carried by the requisite vote [with only Johnny Joannou voting in opposition].

D. Continuity in Representation of Counties

Mr. Rex Alphin Moved to approve the Hampton Roads Transportation Accountability Commission 2015-2016 Legislative Agenda Item "D"; seconded by Mr. Chris Jones. The Motion carried.

E. System-Wide Financing Approach

Mr. Rex Alphin Moved to approve the Hampton Roads Transportation Accountability Commission 2015-2016 Legislative Agenda Item "E"; seconded by Mr. Tom Shepperd. The Motion carried by the requisite vote with only Mr. Kenneth Wright and Mr. Johnny Joannou voting in opposition.

B. Preserve Flexibility to Reimburse Expenditures on I-64 Peninsula Widening Project, Segments I and II, with Proceeds of a Later Bond Issue

Mr. Rex Alphin Moved to approve Action Item "B"; seconded by Ms. Linda Johnson. The Motion carried.

Delegate Chris Jones announced that he had some computer issues at work that necessitated him leaving early and that he wanted the Commission to know he will be sponsoring legislation that would narrow what can be done with a regional approach to tolling. Basically, the bill will state that a toll cannot be imposed without a free alternative.

Mr. Tom Shepperd asked if consideration has been given to an option of congestion tolling. Delegate Jones responded that his intent is to prohibit a "ring of fire" in Hampton Roads because the area cannot economically afford it.

Mr. George Wallace requested clarification that it would mean no tolling imposed if there is not a free alternative; Delegate Jones responded that is exactly what he is trying to accomplish, to make sure a free alternative is available to the citizens.

Mr. Kenneth Wright questioned if Delegate Jones would be opposed to tolling an existing facility; Delegate Jones stated that he would be opposed unless it included new capacity and only tolls on the new capacity.

Chair Sessoms announced that Executive Director Page will meet with each Commission member to solicit input and build consensus on what should be done. Delegate Jones stated that he will be back in touch with the membership regarding the legislative plans.

Mr. Wright asked Chair Sessoms if funds are not available to complete all projects, would one of the options be to do what is affordable and without tolling. For instance, if all projects cannot be funded, would one of the options be to eliminate some projects. Chair Sessoms stated that it could easily be an option. Mr. Wright made the point that he did not want to lock Director Page into funding all nine projects and forcing tolls.

Mr. Haulman noted that members need to ask themselves what can be done with existing money and what alternatives for funding are available.

Chair Sessoms reiterated that the Funding Strategies Advisory Committee was charged with finding a way to finance all nine projects, and it would be HRTAC's job to determine if any were to be cut.

7. Information Items

A. HRTF Financial Report

In the absence of Finance Committee Chair Wagner, Director Page presented the report, including bank account combined cash balances of \$349,972,230.00 with more funds coming in.

He broke down the finances as follows:

- Union Bank and Trust balance of \$61,329,139;
- BB&T balance of \$349,972,230; and
- Transfer from treasury of \$14,025,000.

B. Funding Strategies Advisory Committee -HRTAC Plan of Finance

Committee Chair Neal Crawford commented on some important points:

- The presentation is not the final recommendation;
- HRBT is included in the scenarios because of its huge impact on regional transportation;
- Tolling is the only current revenue enhancement at the disposal of HRTAC;
- Looking at all options for revenue resources is recommended; and
- The economic impact of tolling should be studied, with the help of HRTPO.

Mr. David Miller from PFM reviewed information presented to the Funding Strategies Advisory Committee, which includes a regional finance plan that funds all of the projects. The snapshot included the following:

- Revenues--HRTF revenues; HB2; State of Good Repair money; tolling; bond issuance; additional tax revenue; additional state and federal funding needed;

- Recent reductions of revenues projections;
- Nine candidate studies;
- Tolling options and toll costs;
- Sequencing and schedule of construction with cost estimates; and
- The importance of timing construction.

Ms. Cathie France observed that in the presentation, the Craney Island connector is no longer included as part of Patriots Crossing and asked if that was correct and under whose authority was it eliminated. Mr. Miller responded that it is not funded by or through HRTAC.

Mr. Paul Fraim questioned the various conflicting sets of costs and revenues for projects offered by PFM, VDOT, and the Secretary of Transportation. Mr. James Utterback noted that VDOT's costs did include I-664 improvements all the way through.

Mr. Tom Shepperd noted the variety of numbers and discussion of HOV/HOT conversion on I-64. He referenced the Secretary's comments regarding Northern Virginia and noted that Hampton Roads is different from that region, having the space to expand roads. He pointed out that with the lane conversion and a "ring of fire" tolling, we would spend a great deal of money to bring in more revenue. He questioned the logic of the expenditure and the fact that projects would be delayed.

Mr. Miller responded that the revenues do not cover the costs of the projects and that most toll projects do not completely pay for themselves. He further explained that the costs covered by tolling would reduce the amount of financing needed.

Mr. Fraim and Ms. Grindley Johnson noted that the Port could not pay for the Craney Island connector, so the numbers should reflect its cost.

Mr. Alan Krasnoff expressed concern regarding the timing of construction and the costs of delaying projects, specifically the High Rise Bridge. Mr. Utterback offered an update regarding the High Rise Bridge, specifically that the delay is due to the question of the bridge height. A navigational study has been completed and the Coast Guard is currently evaluating the project. VDOT is doing all the preliminary engineering.

Mr. Krasnoff asked what the Commission could do to help, and Mr. Utterback stated that they need a commitment to move the project forward. Mr. Krasnoff asked the Chair about inclusion on the agenda.

Chair Sessoms responded that he was concerned that the HOT conversion costs do not warrant the expense, and that he is very disturbed by the range of numbers presented. He expressed the need to get better information and acknowledged that HRTAC does not have enough money to get all projects going. He stated that he would make his decision on major water crossings based on what alleviates the most congestion, and noted that at this point he does not have that information. He added that this information is needed quickly.

Mr. George Wallace agreed that the first projects should be chosen based on the maximum impact on congestion mitigation. Chair Sessoms concurred that they will not resolve the decisions at the meeting and that he had asked Director Page to solicit input from each Commission member.

Mr. Wright stated that the Commission needs to give more specific instructions to the Funding Strategies Advisory Committee, because money is being wasted by asking for a plan that attempts to fund every project.

Ms. Grindley Johnson suggested that VDOT, HRTPO, and PFM get together on their numbers prior to Director Page talking to members.

Chair Sessoms reminded the members that the Commission must make sure its funds are used for one purpose—to build new projects.

Ms. Johnson noted decisions may cause the movement of bottlenecks from one location to another. In addition, she noted concern over the possible negative results of the plan if all HB2 district funds were directed to HRTAC projects.

Mr. Rex Alphin commented that there is not enough money to do all projects and recommended prioritizing and finishing some of them.

Mr. Shepperd warned of being paralyzed by indecision, stated that he recalled that the projects had been prioritized, and suggested reviewing the priorities quickly.

Mr. David Yancey questioned whether future tolls on I-64 on the Peninsula with new capacity or HOT was anticipated. Chair Sessoms stated that was not the plan. Mr. Yancey also recommended looking at the economic impact of tolls and a third crossing with Craney Island in the mix.

Director Page noted that the Craney Island project was still projected to be financed by the Port Authority and was not currently in HRTAC's Plan of Finance. Several members noted that the Port Authority would not be able to be responsible for the project.

Director Page remarked that he will ask HRTPO staff to reexamine the projects and then urge the Commission to look at the HRTPO's prioritization model.

C. HRTPO Report of Activities

Mr. Bob Crum spoke on the nature of estimates and their assumptions, specifically that no one knows the costs of Patriot's Crossing or HRBT.

Mr. Shepperd suggested that at the next meeting, VDOT provide the Commission with a list of the most congested crossings. Chair Sessoms asked Director Page to note the request. Mr. Fraim concurred that congestion mitigation was what the Commission is about.

Mr. Shepperd inquired about the difference in the inflation rates between bridges, tunnels, and highways.

Mr. Crum offered to bring the congestion information to the next meeting and help revisit the HRTPO prioritization process. He noted the importance of working closely with the Commission and announced that the Federal Highway Administration has requested an adopted long-range plan update by the end of March. Mr. Crum proposed asking for an extension to June 30, if that would be sufficient time for the Commission.

He announced that HRTPO will be doing a legislative forum on December 16 at 10:00 a.m. with General Assembly members and the federal delegation. He invited the participation of HRTAC.

Next Regular HRTAC meeting date

Mr. Krasnoff Moved for the next meeting to be held on December 16, 2015 at 12 noon; seconded by Mr. Michael Hipple. The Motion carried.

Adjournment

With no further business to come before the Hampton Roads Transportation Accountability Commission, the meeting adjourned at 2:48 p.m.

William D. Sessoms, Jr.
HRTAC Chair